

Diversity and Inclusion for Assessment Practitioners

Presentation at IPAC

Kevin Smith
Tiffany Bennett
Veronica Gilrane*

July 22, 2013

* Special thanks to Anne Hansen and Mark Zorzie for their helpful comments to this presentation

Definitions

Discrimination and Diversity

- **Discrimination**

- Formal

- “Discrimination in hiring, promotions, access, and resource distribution... that in many states is illegal... [and for which] there are often organizational laws, company policies, or social norms against¹”
- Disparate treatment and disparate/adverse impact²

- Subtle

- “Negative or ambivalent demeanor and/or treatment enacted towards social minorities on the basis of their minority status membership that are not unlawful, not necessarily conscious, are likely to convey ambiguous intent, and may engender hesitation by the target to conclusively label the treatment as discrimination.³”

- **Diversity**

- “A unit-level phenomenon where the same demographic differences have different values within a [unit].⁴”
- Diversity Management⁴
- Diversity Climate⁵

1. Hebl, Foster, Mannix, & Dovidio (2002)

2. Avery (2011)

3. Jones, Gilrane, Peddie, Gray, & King (under revision)

4. Paludi (2011)

5. McKay, Avery, & Morris (2008)

Inclusion

- **Inclusion**

- Shift from Diversity to Inclusion⁶
- Definition
 - “The extent to which individuals can access information and resources, are involved in work groups, and have the ability to influence decision-making processes.⁷”
- Distinction between Diversity and Inclusion
 - Method to reduce backlash against ‘diversity’ initiatives⁸
 - Empirical evidence of a distinction between the concepts⁶

6. Roberson (2006)

7. Mor Barak , Cherin, & Berkman (1998)

8. Konrad & Linnehan (1999)

Opportunities to Consider Diversity and Inclusion for Selection Practitioners

- 1. What practices are effective at reducing discrimination?**
 - a. Changing nature of discrimination
 - b. Outcomes of discrimination
 - c. Reducing formal discrimination
 - d. Reducing subtle discrimination

- 2. What should you measure if you want to hire inclusive employees?**
 - a. Post-training measures of inclusivity
 - b. Best Practices for hiring inclusive employees

- 3. What to consider if you are asked to hire more diverse employees because they keep leaving?**
 - a. Reasons for diverse talent turnover
 - b. Best practices for hiring and retaining diverse talent

1. What practices are effective at reducing discrimination?

1a. Changing Nature of Discrimination

- **From formal to subtle discrimination**
- **Despite initiatives to reduce discrimination, racial and gender inequalities in organizations persist⁹⁻¹⁰**
- **Potential reason of inequality?**
 - Tendency of diversity initiatives to target formal, easily recognizable forms of discrimination and to overlook subtle, interpersonal discrimination¹¹

9. Benokraitis (1997)

10. Brief et al. (1997)

11. Shih, Young, & Bucher (2013)

1b. Outcomes of Discrimination¹²

Outcomes	Formal Discrimination	Subtle Discrimination
Work	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lower earnings and decreased job satisfaction¹³ • Lower Supervisor satisfaction, Coworker satisfaction, and increased job withdrawal¹⁴ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Job disengagement²² • Decreased organizational commitment, less confidence to achieve professional goals, poorer relationship quality with supervisors²³
Physical Health	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cardiovascular problems¹⁵⁻¹⁶ • Increase in alcohol and illicit drug use¹⁷ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cardiovascular problems^{16,24} • Increase in alcohol and illicit drug use²⁵
Mental Health	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Decreased positive affect and self-esteem¹⁸⁻¹⁹ • Decreased psychological well-being²⁰ • Increased depression²¹ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lower levels of well-being²⁶ • Decreased feelings of self-worth²³ • Decreased quality of life²⁷

12. Jones, Gilrane, Peddie, Gray, & King (under revision)

13. Hughes & Dodge (1997)

14. Buchanan & Fitzgerald (2008)

15. Guyll, Matthews, & Bromberger (2001)

16. Thompson (1999)

17. Mounts (2004)

18. Motoike (1995)

19. Noh, Kaspar, & Wickrama (2007)

20. Schneider, Swan, & Fitzgerald (1997)

21. Crouter, Davis, Updegraff, Delgado, & Fortner (2006)

22. Tougas, Rinfret, Beaton, & de la Sablonniere (2005)

23. Gifford (2009)

24. Lewis et al. (2006)

25. Miscally (2009)

26. Lim & Cortina (2005)

27. Utsey, Chae, Brown, & Kelly (2002)

1c. What can Practitioners do to Reduce Formal Discrimination?

- **Empirical findings²⁸**
 1. Use alternative predictor measurement
 2. Assess the full range of KSAOs
 3. Banding and score adjustments
 4. Minimize verbal ability requirements to the extent supported by job analysis
- **In practice**
 - Conduct Bias and Insensitivity Reviews

28. Ployhart & Holtz (2008)

1d. What can Practitioners do to Reduce Subtle Discrimination²⁹

- **Difficult to control subtle discrimination²⁹**
- **Strategies³⁰**
 1. Diversity-minded recruitment strategies
 2. Bias-reducing selection and placement practices
 3. Identity-conscious hiring policies
 4. Diversity culture through formal policies
 5. Inclusive diversity training
 6. Management buy-in

29. Triana, Garcia, Colella (2010)

30. Ruggs, Martinez, & Hebl (2011)

2. What should you measure if you want to hire inclusive employees?

2a. Post-training Measures of Inclusivity

- **Self-report behavioral measures of diversity practices**³¹
 - Thirty-eight diversity practices
 - Used to measure diversity training effectiveness
- **Workplace Diversity Survey**³²⁻³³
 - Assesses emotional reactions, judgments, behavioral reactions, personal consequences, & organizational outcomes
 - Used to measure diversity training effectiveness

31. Hanover & Cellar (1998)

32. DeMeuse & Hostager (2001)

33. DeMeuse, Hostager, & O'Neill (2007)

2b. Best Practices for Hiring Inclusive Employees

- **Assess on demonstrated past inclusive behaviors³⁴**
 - Knowledge and values
 - *How important is workforce diversity and inclusion to you?*
 - *What are the benefits of team diversity and inclusion?*
 - Actions and behaviors
 - *Tell me about a time when you achieved superior outcomes by incorporating diverse perspectives?*
 - *How have you handled a situation when a colleague or a direct report was not accepting of others' background, values, or experiences?*
- **Training employees to be inclusive**
 - Reaction to training may be closely related to transfer of training³⁵⁻³⁶
- **Leadership Support**

34. Corporate Leadership Council (2012)

35. Alliger, Tannenbaum, Bennett, Traver, & Shotland (1997)

36. Hanover & Cellar(1998)

3. What to consider if you are asked to hire more diverse employees because they keep leaving?

3a. Reasons for Diverse Talent Turnover

- **“Turnover rates among diverse employees are higher than our total employee population³⁷”**
- **Why do diverse employees leave organizations?**
 - Non-supportive organizational climates³⁸
 - Workplace incivility³⁹
 - Intentions to quit are strong predictors of actual turnover⁴⁰ and strongly linked to loss of profit⁴¹

37. Corporate Leadership Council (2012)

38. King, Hebl, George, Matusik (2010)

39. Lim, Cortina, & Magley (2008)

40. Tett & Meyer (1993)

41. Dess & Shaw(2001)

3b. Best Practices for Hiring and Retaining Diverse Talent

- **Most frequent practices**
 - Diversity recruiting, observing religious holidays, implementing employee engagement surveys, organizing community outreach and cultural events, and conducting bias avoidance and stereotype training⁴²
 - Mixed, limited results⁴³⁻⁴⁴
- **Effective Practices**⁴³⁻⁴⁴
 - Diversity councils, targeted recruiting, work-life balance programs, and inclusion of minorities in top management
 - Especially when **top management** is **accountable** for the success of the program

42. Paludi,, Paludi, & DeSouza, (2011)

43. Kalev, Dobbin, & Kelly (2006)

44. Kravitz (2008)

Questions?

References

Alliger, G. M., Tannenbaum, S. I., Bennett, W., Jr., Traver, H., & Shotland, A. (1997). A meta-analysis of the relations among training criteria. *Personnel Psychology, 50*(2), 341-358.

Avery, D. R. (2011). Why the playing field remains uneven: Impediments to promotions in organizations. In S. Zedeck (Ed.), *APA Handbooks in Psychology. APA handbook of industrial and organizational psychology, Vol. 3. Maintaining, expanding, and contracting the organization* (pp. 577-613).

Benokraitis, N. V. (1997). Sex discrimination in the 21st century. In N. V. Benokraitis (Ed.), *Subtle sexism: Current practice and prospects for change*, 5-33. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Buchanan, N. T., & Fitzgerald, L. F. (2008). Effects of racial and sexual harassment on work and the psychological well-being of African American women. *Journal of Occupational Health Psychology, 13*, 137-151.

Corporate Leadership Council (2012). *Creativing Competitive Advantage through Workforce Diversity*. Corporate Executive Board, Arlington VA.

Cortina, L. M. (2008). Unseen injustice: Incivility as modern discrimination in organizations. *The Academy of Management Review, 33*(1), 55-75.

Crouter, A. C., Davis, K. D., Updegraff, K., Delgado, M., & Fortner, M. (2006). Mexican American Fathers' Occupational Conditions: Links to Family Members' Psychological Adjustment. *Journal of Marriage and Family, 68*(4), 843-858.

De Meuse, K. P., & Hostager, T. J. (2001). Developing an instrument for measuring attitudes toward and perceptions of workplace diversity: An initial report. *Human Resource Development Quarterly, 12*(1), 33-51.

References (Cont.)

De Meuse, K. P., Hostager, T. J., & O'Neill, K. S. (2007). A longitudinal evaluation of senior managers' perceptions and attitudes of a workplace diversity training program. *Human Resource Planning*, 30(2), 38-46.

Dess, G., & Shaw, J.D. (2001). Voluntary turnover, social capital, and organizational performance. *Academy of Management Review*, 26 (3), 446-456.

Gifford, G. T. (2009). Stigma in the workplace: Testing a framework for the effects of demographic and perceived differences in organizations. *Dissertation Abstracts International Section A: Humanities and Social Sciences*. 1709

Guyll, M., Matthews, K. A., & Bromberger, J. T. (2001). Discrimination and unfair treatment: Relationship to cardiovascular reactivity among African American and European American women. *Health Psychology*, 20(5), 315-325.

Hanover, J. & Cellar, D. (1998). Environmental factors and the effectiveness of workforce diversity training. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*, 9(2), 105-124.

Hebl, M. R., Foster, J. B., Mannix, L. M., & Dovidio, J. F. (2002). Formal and interpersonal discrimination: A field study of bias toward homosexual applicants. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, 28(6), 815-825. Hughes & Dodge (1997)

Jones, K., Gilrane, V., Peddie, C., Gray, A. & King, E (under revision). Not so subtle: A meta-analytic investigation of the correlates of subtle and overt discrimination. *Under First Revision at Journal of Management*.

Kalev, A., Dobbin, F., & Kelly, E. (2006). Best Practices or Best Guesses? Assessing the Efficacy of Corporate Affirmative Action and Diversity Policies. *American Sociological Review*, 71(4), 589-617.

References (Cont.)

King, E. B., Hebl, M. R., George, J. M., & Matusik, S. F. (2010). Understanding tokenism: Antecedents and consequences of a psychological climate of gender inequity. *Journal of Management*, 36(2), 482-510.

Mor Barak, E.M., Cherin, D. A., & Berkman, S. (1998). Organizational and personal dimensions in diversity climate: Ethnic and gender differences in employee perceptions. *Journal of Applied Behavioral Science*, 34(1), 82-104.

Mounts, N. S. (2004). Contributions of parenting and campus climate to freshmen adjustment in a multiethnic sample. *Journal of Adolescent Research*, 19, 468-491.

Motoike, P.T. (1995). The effect of blatant and subtle discrimination on emotions and coping in Asian American university students. *Dissertation Abstracts International Section A: Humanities and Social Sciences*, 55 (12-A).

Noh, S., Kaspar, V., & Wickrama, K. A. (2007). Overt and subtle racial discrimination and mental health: Preliminary findings for Korean immigrants. *American Journal of Public Health*, 97, 1269-1274.

Paludi, M. A., Paludi, C. A., Jr., & DeSouza, E. R. (Eds.). (2011). *Praeger handbook on understanding and preventing workplace discrimination (Vols. 1 & 2)*. Santa Barbara, CA: Praeger/ABC-CLIO.

Ployhart, R.E., & Holtz, B.C. (2008). The diversity-validity dilemma: Strategies for reducing racioethnic and sex subgroup differences and adverse impact in selection. *Personnel Psychology*, 61, 153-172.4

Roberson, Q. (2006). Disentangling the meanings of diversity and inclusion in organizations. *Group and Organization Management*, 31, (2), 212-236.

Ruggs, E. N., Martinez, L. R., & Hebl, M. R. (2011). How individuals and organizations can reduce interpersonal discrimination. *Social and Personality Psychology Compass*, 5(1), 29-42.

References (Cont.)

- Schneider, K. T., Swan, S., & Fitzgerald, L. F. (1997). Job-related and psychological effects of sexual harassment in the workplace: Empirical evidence from two organizations. *Journal of Applied Psychology, 82*, 401-415.
- Shih, M., Young, M. J., & Bucher, A. (2013). Working to reduce the effects of discrimination: Identity management strategies in organizations. *American Psychologist, 68*, 145-157.
- Tett, R. P., & Meyer, J. P. (1993). Job satisfaction, organizational commitment, turnover intention, and turnover: Path analyses based on meta-analytic findings. *Personnel Psychology, 46*(2), 259-293.
- Thompson, H. S. (1999). The relationship between chronic acculturative/racial stressors and cardiovascular outcomes in African-American adults: Is cardiovascular reactivity a mediating variable? *Dissertation Abstracts International: Section B: The Sciences and Engineering*. 4914. Tougas, Rinfret, Beaton, & de la Sablonniere (2005)
- Triana, M. d. C., García, M. F., & Colella, A. (2010). Managing diversity: How organizational efforts to support diversity moderate the effects of perceived racial discrimination on affective commitment. *Personnel Psychology, 63*(4), 817-843.
- Utsey, S. O., Chae, M. H., Brown, C. F., & Kelly, D. (2002). Effect of ethnic group membership on ethnic identity, race-related stress and quality of life. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology, 8*(4), 366-377.