



# Using SME Ratings to Determine Best and Worst Situational Judgment Test Response Options

July 25, 2023

**Presented by:** Emily A. Rost, Ph.D., HumRRO  
Ashley Jorgensen, Ph.D., HumRRO

# SJT Background

- High stakes selection battery for a large government employer
- Measure competencies related to the job (e.g., adaptability, team building)
- Created using workplace incidents submitted by job incumbents
- Typically, 6 response options are created based on the scenario
- Items go under a series of reviews leaving them with 4 – 5 response options on the test



# SJT Format

- Applicants select the Best and Worst actions.

You lead a team that has frequent team meetings. One team member rarely comments during team discussions. You know the team member has valuable knowledge and experience, and you think others on the team would benefit from more of the team member's perspective. What should you do?

- a. Specifically ask for the team member's opinion during team discussions.
- b. Talk with the team member one-on-one and later relay the team member's ideas to the team.
- c. Identify someone else with similar experience to replace the team member.
- d. Recommend the team member comment more often during team discussions.
- e. Ask others on the team to encourage the team member to make comments.
- f. Tell the team member's supervisor that they are not contributing.

Stem / Scenario

Response  
Options

# How do we determine Best and Worst?

- Subject matter experts tell us if the scenario is job-related, needed at entry, and realistic.
- Confidence Intervals
  - Subject matter experts rate the effectiveness of each response option from 1 (*Very Ineffective*) to 7 (*Very Effective*).
  - We compute confidence intervals around the average for each response option.
  - The confidence interval for the Best response must clear the confidence interval of the second best response.
  - The confidence interval for the Worst response must clear the confidence interval of the second worst response.
- Conceptually Best and Worst
  - Ensure the option with the highest average effectiveness rating is conceptually the best action.
  - Ensure the option with the lowest average effectiveness rating is conceptually the worst action.
- This ensures that conceptually and statistically the Best is truly best, and the Worst is truly worst.

# Sample Item

Innovative. Responsive. Impactful.

# Statistically Determining the Best Action

- 6.91 is greater than 4.28, 1.26, 5.52, 3.41 and 1.46.
- The Best confidence interval clears.
- A is the Best action.

Item/ Option	SJT	Mean	SD	80CI L	80 CI H	Best CI Clears?	Worst CI Clears?
1	You lead a team that has frequent team meetings. One team member rarely comments during team discussions. You know the team member has valuable knowledge and experience, and you think others on the team would benefit from more of the team member's perspective. What should you do?						
A	Specifically ask for the team member's opinion during team discussions.	6.91	0.30	6.79	7.03	CI Clears	
B	Talk with the team member one-on-one and later relay the team member's ideas to the team.	3.55	1.81	2.82	4.28		
C	Identify someone else with similar experience to replace the team member.	1.09	0.43	0.92	1.26		
D	Recommend the team member comment more often during team discussions.	4.82	1.72	4.12	5.52		
E	Ask others on the team to encourage the team member to make comments.	3.23	0.45	3.05	3.41		
F	Tell the team member's supervisor that they are not contributing.	1.23	0.56	1.00	1.46		

# Statistically Determining the Worst Action

- 1.09 is less than 6.79, 2.82, 4.12, and 3.05, **but not 1.00**.
- The Worst confidence interval **does not clear**.

Item/ Option	SJT	Mean	SD	80CI L	80 CI H	Best CI Clears?	Worst CI Clears?
1	You lead a team that has frequent team meetings. One team member rarely comments during team discussions. You know the team member has valuable knowledge and experience, and you think others on the team would benefit from more of the team member's perspective. What should you do?						
A	Specifically ask for the team member's opinion during team discussions.	6.91	0.30	6.79	7.03	CI Clears	
B	Talk with the team member one-on-one and later relay the team member's ideas to the team.	3.55	1.81	2.82	4.28		
C	Identify someone else with similar experience to replace the team member.	1.09	0.43	0.92	1.26		
D	Recommend the team member comment more often during team discussions.	4.82	1.72	4.12	5.52		
E	Ask others on the team to encourage the team member to make comments.	3.23	0.45	3.05	3.41		
F	Tell the team member's supervisor that they are not contributing.	1.23	0.56	1.00	1.46		

# Statistically Determining the Worst Action

- We remove option F.
- 1.09 is less than 6.79, 2.82, 4.12, and 3.05.
- The Worst confidence interval clears.
- C is the Worst action.

Item/ Option	SJT	Mean	SD	80CI L	80 CI H	Best CI Clears?	Worst CI Clears?
1	You lead a team that has frequent team meetings. One team member rarely comments during team discussions. You know the team member has valuable knowledge and experience, and you think others on the team would benefit from more of the team member's perspective. What should you do?						
A	Specifically ask for the team member's opinion during team discussions.	6.91	0.30	6.79	7.03	CI Clears	
B	Talk with the team member one-on-one and later relay the team member's ideas to the team.	3.55	1.81	2.82	4.28		
C	Identify someone else with similar experience to replace the team member.	1.09	0.43	0.92	1.26		CI Clears
D	Recommend the team member comment more often during team discussions.	4.82	1.72	4.12	5.52		
E	Ask others on the team to encourage the team member to make comments.	3.23	0.45	3.05	3.41		
F							



# Conceptual Check

- A is the Best action and is conceptually better than all other actions.
- C is the Worst action and is conceptually worse than all other actions.

You lead a team that has frequent team meetings. One team member rarely comments during team discussions. You know the team member has valuable knowledge and experience, and you think others on the team would benefit from more of the team member's perspective. What should you do?

- a. Specifically ask for the team member's opinion during team discussions.
- b. Talk with the team member one-on-one and later relay the team member's ideas to the team.
- c. Identify someone else with similar experience to replace the team member.
- d. Recommend the team member comment more often during team discussions.
- e. Ask others on the team to encourage the team member to make comments.

Stem / Scenario

Response  
Options

# Summary

- We have determined conceptually and statistically that A is the Best Action and C is the Worst Action.

You lead a team that has frequent team meetings. One team member rarely comments during team discussions. You know the team member has valuable knowledge and experience, and you think others on the team would benefit from more of the team member's perspective. What should you do?

Stem / Scenario

- a. Specifically ask for the team member's opinion during team discussions. – **Best Action**
- b. Talk with the team member one-on-one and later relay the team member's ideas to the team.
- c. Identify someone else with similar experience to replace the team member. – **Worst Action**
- d. Recommend the team member comment more often during team discussions.
- e. Ask others on the team to encourage the team member to make comments.

Response Options

# Thank You!

For more information  
please contact:

Emily Rost  
[erost@humrro.org](mailto:erost@humrro.org)

