Diversity and Inclusion for Assessment Practitioners

Presentation at IPAC

Kevin Smith
Tiffany Bennett
Veronica Gilrane*

* Special thanks to Anne Hansen and Mark Zorzie for their helpful comments to this presentation

July 22, 2013
Definitions
Discrimination and Diversity

• **Discrimination**
  • Formal
    • “Discrimination in hiring, promotions, access, and resource distribution... that in many states is illegal... [and for which] there are often organizational laws, company policies, or social norms against⁴”
    • Disparate treatment and disparate/adverse impact²
  • Subtle
    • “Negative or ambivalent demeanor and/or treatment enacted towards social minorities on the basis of their minority status membership that are not unlawful, not necessarily conscious, are likely to convey ambiguous intent, and may engender hesitation by the target to conclusively label the treatment as discrimination.³”

• **Diversity**
  • “A unit-level phenomenon where the same demographic differences have different values within a [unit].⁴”
  • Diversity Management⁴
  • Diversity Climate⁵

---

1. Hebl, Foster, Mannix, & Dovidio (2002)
2. Avery (2011)
3. Jones, Gilrane, Peddie, Gray, & King (under revision)
4. Paludi (2011)
Inclusion

- **Inclusion**
  - Shift from Diversity to Inclusion\(^6\)
  - Definition
    - “The extent to which individuals can access information and resources, are involved in work groups, and have the ability to influence decision-making processes.”\(^7\)
  - Distinction between Diversity and Inclusion
    - Method to reduce backlash against ‘diversity’ initiatives\(^8\)
    - Empirical evidence of a distinction between the concepts\(^6\)

---

7. Mor Barak, Cherin, & Berkman (1998)
Opportunities to Consider Diversity and Inclusion for Selection Practitioners

1. What practices are effective at reducing discrimination?
   a. Changing nature of discrimination
   b. Outcomes of discrimination
   c. Reducing formal discrimination
   d. Reducing subtle discrimination

2. What should you measure if you want to hire inclusive employees?
   a. Post-training measures of inclusivity
   b. Best Practices for hiring inclusive employees

3. What to consider if you are asked to hire more diverse employees because they keep leaving?
   a. Reasons for diverse talent turnover
   b. Best practices for hiring and retaining diverse talent
1. What practices are effective at reducing discrimination?
1a. Changing Nature of Discrimination

- From formal to subtle discrimination
- Despite initiatives to reduce discrimination, racial and gender inequalities in organizations persist\(^9-10\)
- Potential reason of inequality?
  - Tendency of diversity initiatives to target formal, easily recognizable forms of discrimination and to overlook subtle, interpersonal discrimination\(^11\)

11. Shih, Young, & Bucher (2013)
### 1b. Outcomes of Discrimination

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcomes</th>
<th>Formal Discrimination</th>
<th>Subtle Discrimination</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Work</td>
<td>• Lower earnings and decreased job satisfaction\textsuperscript{13}</td>
<td>• Job disengagement\textsuperscript{22}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Lower Supervisor satisfaction, Coworker satisfaction, and increased job withdrawal\textsuperscript{14}</td>
<td>• Decreased organizational commitment, less confidence to achieve professional goals, poorer relationship quality with supervisors\textsuperscript{23}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Health</td>
<td>• Cardiovascular problems\textsuperscript{15-16}</td>
<td>• Cardiovascular problems\textsuperscript{16,24}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Increase in alcohol and illicit drug use\textsuperscript{17}</td>
<td>• Increase in alcohol and illicit drug use\textsuperscript{25}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental Health</td>
<td>• Decreased positive affect and self-esteem\textsuperscript{18-19}</td>
<td>• Lower levels of well-being\textsuperscript{26}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Decreased psychological well-being\textsuperscript{20}</td>
<td>• Decreased feelings of self-worth\textsuperscript{23}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Increased depression\textsuperscript{21}</td>
<td>• Decreased quality of life\textsuperscript{27}</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

12. Jones, Gilrane, Peddie, Gray, & King (under revision)
15. Guyll, Matthews, & Bromberger (2001)
23. Gifford (2009)
24. Lewis et al. (2006)
1c. What can Practitioners do to Reduce Formal Discrimination?

- **Empirical findings**
  1. Use alternative predictor measurement
  2. Assess the full range of KSAOs
  3. Banding and score adjustments
  4. Minimize verbal ability requirements to the extent supported by job analysis

- **In practice**
  - Conduct Bias and Insensitivity Reviews

---

1d. What can Practitioners do to Reduce Subtle Discrimination

- Difficult to control subtle discrimination

- **Strategies**
  1. Diversity-minded recruitment strategies
  2. Bias-reducing selection and placement practices
  3. Identity-conscious hiring policies
  4. Diversity culture through formal policies
  5. Inclusive diversity training
  6. Management buy-in

30. Ruggs, Martinez, & Hebl (2011)
2. What should you measure if you want to hire inclusive employees?
2a. Post-training Measures of Inclusivity

• **Self-report behavioral measures of diversity practices**\(^{31}\)
  - Thirty-eight diversity practices
  - Used to measure diversity training effectiveness

• **Workplace Diversity Survey**\(^{32-33}\)
  - Assesses emotional reactions, judgments, behavioral reactions, personal consequences, & organizational outcomes
  - Used to measure diversity training effectiveness

---

32. DeMeuse & Hostager (2001)
2b. Best Practices for Hiring Inclusive Employees

• **Assess on demonstrated past inclusive behaviors**\(^{34}\)
  - Knowledge and values
    - *How important is workforce diversity and inclusion to you?*
    - *What are the benefits of team diversity and inclusion?*
  - Actions and behaviors
    - *Tell me about a time when you achieved superior outcomes by incorporating diverse perspectives?*
    - *How have you handled a situation when a colleague or a direct report was not accepting of others’ background, values, or experiences?*

• **Training employees to be inclusive**
  - Reaction to training may be closely related to transfer of training\(^{35-36}\)

• **Leadership Support**

---

\(^{34}\) Corporate Leadership Council (2012)

\(^{35}\) Alliger, Tannenbaum, Bennett, Traver, & Shotland (1997)

\(^{36}\) Hanover & Cellar(1998)
3. What to consider if you are asked to hire more diverse employees because they keep leaving?
3a. Reasons for Diverse Talent Turnover

• “Turnover rates among diverse employees are higher than our total employee population\textsuperscript{37}”

• Why do diverse employees leave organizations?
  • Non-supportive organizational climates\textsuperscript{38}
  • Workplace incivility\textsuperscript{39}
  • Intentions to quit are strong predictors of actual turnover\textsuperscript{40} and strongly linked to loss of profit\textsuperscript{41}

\textsuperscript{37.} Corporate Leadership Council (2012)
\textsuperscript{38.} King, Hebl, George, Matusik (2010)
\textsuperscript{39.} Lim, Cortina, & Magley (2008)
\textsuperscript{40.} Tett & Meyer (1993)
\textsuperscript{41.} Dess & Shaw (2001)
3b. Best Practices for Hiring and Retaining Diverse Talent

• **Most frequent practices**
  - Diversity recruiting, observing religious holidays, implementing employee engagement surveys, organizing community outreach and cultural events, and conducting bias avoidance and stereotype training\(^{42}\)
  - Mixed, limited results\(^{43-44}\)

• **Effective Practices\(^{43-44}\)**
  - Diversity councils, targeted recruiting, work-life balance programs, and inclusion of minorities in top management
  - Especially when **top management** is **accountable** for the success of the program

---

42. Paludi, Paludi, & DeSouza, (2011)
43. Kalev, Dobbin, & Kelly (2006)
44. Kravitz (2008)
Questions?
References


Corporate Leadership Council (2012). Creativing Competitive Advantage through Workforce Diversity. Corporate Executive Board, Arlington VA.


References (Cont.)


